HAWKING HAWKERS
TWO TALES AND A PORTRAIT OF ANARCHY

Gita Dewan Verma, January 2002
Engaging highest levels in government... Precipitated by premier NGOs...
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>MANUSHI</th>
<th>SEWA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td><strong>Film</strong> on hawkers / rickshaw pullers</td>
<td>International Alliance Street Vendors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>BELLAGIO DECLARATION</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td></td>
<td>National Alliance ... <strong>NASVI</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>NASVI</strong> Regional Meetings, etc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>NASVI</strong> National Meeting, Ahmedabad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Urban21 Conference, Berlin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td></td>
<td>Lobbying Planning Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April</td>
<td>Conference</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May</td>
<td><strong>Film screened</strong></td>
<td><strong>MoUD-SEWA</strong> National Policy Dialogue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>MoUD-SEWA</strong> RECOMMENDATIONS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td><strong>Manushi NOT included</strong></td>
<td>National Task Force... <strong>MoUD-NASVI</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wrote CVC... wrote CM, MCD, Police</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>First Lok Sunwayi</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August</td>
<td><strong>PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG</strong></td>
<td><strong>MoUD</strong> Task Force letter to states</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Second Lok Sunwayi</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>Haats</em> scheme... <em>Manushi</em> opposition</td>
<td><strong>MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><em>'Sayam rekhas'</em></td>
<td><strong>HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>MANUSHI</td>
<td>SEWA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td><strong>Film</strong> on hawkers /rickshaw pullers</td>
<td>International Alliance Street Vendors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>BELLAGIO DECLARATION</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td></td>
<td>National Alliance ... <strong>NASVI</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>NASVI</strong> Regional Meetings, etc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>NASVI</strong> National Meeting, Ahmedabad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td></td>
<td>Urban21 Conference, Berlin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td></td>
<td>Lobbying Planning Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April</td>
<td>Conference</td>
<td>MoUD-SEWA National Policy Dialogue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May</td>
<td><strong>Film screened</strong></td>
<td>MoUD-SEWA <strong>RECOMMENDATIONS</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td><strong>Manushi NOT included</strong></td>
<td>National Task Force... MoUD-NASVI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td><strong>Wrote CVC</strong>...wrote CM,MCD,Police <strong>First Lok Sunwayi</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August</td>
<td><strong>PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG</strong></td>
<td>MoUD Task Force letter to states</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August</td>
<td><strong>Second Lok Sunwayi</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Haats</strong> scheme... <strong>Manushi</strong> opposition</td>
<td>MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>‘Sayam rekhas’</strong></td>
<td><strong>HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
BELLAGIO DECLARATION

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR
BELLAGIO DECLARATION

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR
in the fast growing urban sector there is a proliferation of poor hawkers and vendors

informal sector now constitutes majority of urban workforce... vendors are more than one crore

Manushi's figure of 5-6 lakh hawkers in Delhi

...Planning Comm: 3 lakh; SEWA: 2 lakh

PROBLEM PERSPECTIVE

1. Scale / Net significance
   • large and growing
BELLAGIO DECLARATION

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS
supply all types of commodities ... to the urban population at reasonable prices

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG
provide low cost, easily accessible retail ... services to urban households

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A
proposes research to analyse perceptions of people about their usefulness to the society

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR

PROBLEM PERSPECTIVE

1. Scale / Net significance
   • large and growing
   • performance
     • meet needs
BELLAGIO DECLARATION

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

have always been part of Indian urban culture of public spaces and services

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

presence reduces the scope for eve-teasing, reduce transport requirement... pollution

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR

PROBLEM PERSPECTIVE

1. Scale / Net significance
   • large and growing
   • performance
     • meet needs
     • other benefits
Hawkers are creating their own employment ... also indirect employment for others

easiest occupations to enter for poor... employment ...enhance societal welfare... ...be encouraged as matter of public policy
PROBLEM PERSPECTIVE

1. Scale / Net significance
   - large and growing
   - performance
     - meet needs
     - other benefits
     - employment
     - economic role

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

contributes significantly to GDP of the urban economy… 6000 cr annual turnover in Mumbai
PROBLEM PERSPECTIVE

1. Scale / Net significance
   - large and growing
   - performance
   - nuisance
     - hygiene
     - security / crime

concern is not categorically different from that due to other service providers
### BELLAGIO DECLARATION

### MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

### PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

Limited by market demand... varies... can be disaggregated... green, amber, red...

### MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

Proposes analysis of spatial dimensions of hawking ... and associated urban problems

### HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR

### PROBLEM PERSPECTIVE

1. **Scale / Net significance**
   - large and growing
   - performance
   - nuisance
     - hygiene
     - security / crime
     - street congestion
subjected to constant mental and physical torture by local officials...

harassed by the police and municipal authorities

destruction or misappropriation of hawkers wares by police and municipal functionaries

a ‘study objective’ is: Protecting hawkers from unauthorised harassment by various agencies

1. Scale / Net significance
   - large and growing
   - performance
   - nuisance

2. Hawkers’ problems
   - harassment
PROBLEM PERSPECTIVE

1. Scale / Net significance
   - large and growing
   - performance
   - nuisance

2. Hawkers’ problems
   - harassment
   - extortion

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

Even ‘legal payments’ unreasonable… ‘fine’ for release of confiscated goods exceeds value

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

Re Manushi’s estimate of Rs.50 crores per month… “the figure is not beyond credibility”

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR
BELLAGIO DECLARATION

Links hawking to poverty, unemployment and forced migration

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

Street vendors... remain poor, illiterate
Jagmohan: tendency to remain a hawker

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

Hawkers belong to the poorest sections of urban society

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR

Need to educate and motivate hawkers to move out of the sector in future

PROBLEM PERSPECTIVE

1. Scale / Net significance
   - large and growing
   - performance
   - nuisance

2. Hawkers’ problems
   - harassment
   - extortion
   - economic hardship

It appears…

While endorsing hawking offers an opportunity to break out of poverty, it is also conceded that hawkers remain, nevertheless, poor and are unable to break out of hawking
BELLAGIO DECLARATION

seeks for hawkers “legal status by issuing licenses”, etc

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

achieve ‘removal’ not ‘effective regulation’ ... number of licenses only fraction of hawkers

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

enforcers collect rents, consumers pay more, providers (and hence employment) is reduced

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

mentions in its objectives the “importance of monthly rentals”

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR

Arrived at a consensus that all hawkers should be licensed

PROBLEM PERSPECTIVE

1. Scale / Net significance
   - large and growing
   - performance
   - nuisance

2. Hawkers’ problems
   - harassment
   - extortion
   - economic hardship

3. Governance Failures
   - restrictive licensing

Except *Manushi*/PMO all seem see the problem with licensing as one of quantitative inadequacy rather unacceptability in principle
BELLAGIO DECLARATION

hawkers are looked upon as a hindrance to planned development... by elite and planners

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

hawkers...excluded from town planning schemes
Most speakers criticised plans and planners

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

does not directly mention planning failures... proposes red/green/amber spatial zones

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

most objectives relate to planning provisions – norms/standards, design guidelines, etc

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR

Motor Vehicles Act, 1989 and other Urban Planning Acts do not have any provision...

PROBLEM PERSPECTIVE

1. Scale / Net significance
   - large and growing
   - performance
   - nuisance

2. Hawkers’ problems
   - harassment
   - extortion
   - economic hardship

3. Governance Failures
   - restrictive licensing
   - exclusionary planning
### SOLUTION SCENARIO

1. **Scale / Net significance**
   - large and growing

2. **Hawkers’ problems**
   - harassment
   - extortion
   - economic hardship

3. **Governance Failures**
   - restrictive licensing
   - exclusionary planning

4. **Others**

---

### MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

**#4.** Surveys in all urban areas to determine the number and locations of street vendors

---

### PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

DIFFERENT VIEW: continuing system of registration...with no numerical limits

---

### MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

**#1.** To examine the nature and extent of hawking activities... QUALITATIVE?

---

### HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR

**#10.** Extensive studies should be carried out to build city wise data base... QUALITATIVE?
**BELLAGIO DECLARATION**

#4. protect and expand vendors' existing livelihood

**MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS**

#11. Promote …centrally sponsored schemes
Secy: bad employment scene…policy for more
Jagmohan: lamented hawkers remain hawkers

**PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG**

**MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A**

#8. …globalisation and consequent redundancy

**HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR**

**SOLUTION SCENARIO**

1. Scale / Net significance
   - large and growing

DIVERGENT OPINION
   - nuisance

2. Hawkers’ problems
   - harassment
   - extortion
   - economic hardship

3. Governance Failures
   - restrictive licensing
   - exclusionary planning

4. Others
MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS
Jt.Secy: “Carve a niche... make yourself indispensable ...Send a message...you matter”

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG
does mention ‘technology upgradation’... but as desirable outcome not strategic component

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR

SOLUTION SCENARIO

1. Scale / Net significance
   - large and growing
   - performance

2. Hawkers’ problems
   - harassment
   - extortion
   - economic hardship

3. Governance Failures
   - restrictive licensing
   - exclusionary planning

4. Others
BELLAGIO DECLARATION

#6. promote self-governance

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

NEXT STEP: Promote education of member vendors about self-regulation / quality of service

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

Red/amber/green zones for ‘self-regulating’ solution to the problem of street congestion

Later… Manushi was drawing Sayam Rekhas

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR

SOLUTION SCENARIO

1. Scale / Net significance
   - large and growing
   - performance
   - nuisance

   SELF

   REGULATION!

2. Hawkers’ problems
   - harassment
   - extortion
   - economic hardship

3. Governance Failures
   - restrictive licensing
   - exclusionary planning

4. Others
1. Scale / Net significance

2. Hawkers’ problems
   - harassment
   - extortion
   - economic hardship

3. Governance Failures
   - restrictive licensing
   - exclusionary planning

4. Others

SOLUTION SCENARIO

NOT MUCH

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

absolute prohibition on impounding, destruction or seizure, of goods and equipment

But this has not happened...

Assumes... result of restrictive licensing and alternative regime will be abuse-free

Despite CVC intervention... no suggestions about dealing with the corruption that breeds extortion

Others also say nothing on corruption
**SOLUTION SCENARIO**

1. **Scale / Net significance**
   - **NOT MUCH**

2. **Hawkers’ problems**
   - harassment
   - extortion
   - **SELF GOVERNANCE !!!**

3. **Governance Failures**
   - restrictive licensing
   - exclusionary planning

4. **Others**

---

**BELLAGIO DECLARATION**

**MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS**

Minister of State: requested them not to give bribe as it breeds corruption in the society

Former Chief Justice: should be trained and disciplined ...fight against their exploitation...

Minister: hoped that through NASVI problems confronting them will be solved

ILO Director: bureaucrats unfriendly... licensing inflexible... traders hostile... fight themselves

Joint Comm, Police: (not of police reform) but Delhi Police-SEWA identity cards for hawkers
1. Scale / Net significance

- harassment
- extortion

3. Governance Failures
- restrictive licensing
- exclusionary planning
BELLAGIO DECLARATION

#9. provide street vendors with meaningful access to credit and financial services

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

#16. Promote credit schemes and micro-finance for the vendors

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

Formal economy institutions would perceive less risk if hawkers were properly identified

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

#5. possibilities of incorporating them in SJSRY
#6. improving…access to institutional credit

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR

#8. Hawkers may be facilitated with financial assistance in order to promote their enterprises

SOLUTION SCENARIO

1. Scale / Net significance

NOT MUCH

2. Hawkers’ problems

CREDIT despite EXTORTION and low capital outlay, etc
- economic hardship

3. Governance Failures
- restrictive licensing
- exclusionary planning

4. Others
BELLAGIO DECLARATION

#6. guidelines for supportive services
#10. relief in disasters / natural calamities
#11. child vendors... persons with disabilities

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

#7. priority to women vendors
ILO Director: ‘development’ not regulation
Jt.Secy: Welfare measures... housing, health...

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR

SOLUTION SCENARIO

1. Scale / Net significance

   NOT MUCH

2. Hawkers’ problems

   OTHER INTERVENTION TOO...
   • economic hardship

3. Governance Failures
   • restrictive licensing
   • exclusionary planning

4. Others
1. Scale / Net significance

2. Hawkers’ problems

3. Governance Failures

4. Others
   • National policy

CONSENSUS CAN’T BE PRESUMED
BELLAGIO DECLARATION

#8. appropriate, participatory, non-formal mechanisms with ... NGOs...

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

#12. importance of dialogue... create forums
#13. self-governance... Committees
3 of 5 NEXT STEPS: NGO role at policy level

Director MoUD: requested municipal authorities to work in tandem with SEWA

Former Chief Justice: said organizations like SEWA should organize vendors in all cities

Joint Comm: Delhi police needs SEWA help to issue Identity cards

SEWA: demanded that SEWA be allowed to speak up for the vendors in the courts

SOLUTION SCENARIO

1. Scale / Net significance

   NOT MUCH

2. Hawkers’ problems

   NOT MUCH

3. Governance Failures

   MOST

4. Others
   • National policy
   • Role of NGOs
BELLAGIO DECLARATION
#8. appropriate, participatory, non-formal mechanisms with representation by street vendors and hawkers, NGOs...

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS
#12. importance of dialogue... create forums #13. self-governance... Committees
3 of 5 NEXT STEPS: NGO role at policy level

SOLUTION SCENARIO

1. Scale / Net significance
   NOT MUCH

2. Hawkers’ problems
   NOT MUCH

3. Governance Failures
   MOST

4. Others
   • National policy
   • Role of NGOs

CONSENSUS CAN’T BE PRESUMED
BELLAGIO DECLARATION

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS
#10. solutions thru best practices...India/abroad
NEXT #2: Collect/disseminate BPs India/abroad
Jt Secy: Municipal capacity building

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR

SOLUTION SCENARIO

1. Scale / Net significance
   NOT MUCH

2. Hawkers’ problems
   NOT MUCH

3. Governance Failures
   MOST

4. Others
   CONSENSUS CAN’T BE PRESUMED
1. Scale / Net significance

2. Hawkers’ problems

3. Governance Failures

4. Others

- Consensus can’t be presumed
BELLAGIO DECLARATION

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR

SOLUTION SCENARIO

1. Scale / Net significance
2. Hawkers’ problems
3. Governance Failures

Most

4. Others
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>SOLUTION SCENARIO</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Scale / Net significance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Hawkers’ problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Governance Failures</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**MOST**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>4. Others</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS**

- Restrictive licensing
- Exclusionary planning

**PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG**

**MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A**

**HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR**

**BELLAGIO DECLARATION**
BELLAGIO DECLARATION

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR

SOLUTION SCENARIO

1. Scale / Net significance
2. Hawkers’ problems
3. Governance Failures
   - restrictive licensing
   - exclusionary planning
4. Others
### SOLUTION SCENARIO

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Scale / Net significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Hawkers’ problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Governance Failures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• restrictive licensing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMO: dismantle license regime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others: modify...more responsive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concerns substantively similar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Others</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**BELLAGIO DECLARATION**

#2. give legal status by issuing licences

**MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS**

#3. legal recognition by giving identity cards

**PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG**

registration of all hawkers

**MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A**

#3. hawkers should be licensed

**SOLUTION SCENARIO**

1. Scale / Net significance
2. Hawkers’ problems
   - restrictive licensing
     - legal recognition
     - exclusionary planning
3. Governance Failures
4. Others

#3. legal recognition by giving identity cards

#2. give legal status by issuing licences

#3. hawkers should be licensed
MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

#2. The policy of the urban local body should move from Removal to Effective Regulation

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

prohibition on ...impounding, destruction, or seizure, of goods and equipment alternative (license-free) regulatory regime

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR

SOLUTION SCENARIO

1. Scale / Net significance

2. Hawkers’ problems

3. Governance Failures
   • restrictive licensing
     • legal recognition
     • regulation, not removal

   • exclusionary planning

4. Others
**BELLAGIO DECLARATION**

**MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS**

#14. mechanisms where vendors will pay fees ... which will add to the revenue of the city

**PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG**

‘Amber’ zone fee “need not be nominal...”

**MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A**

#7. the importance of …monthly rental

**HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR**

---

**SOLUTION SCENARIO**

1. Scale / Net significance
2. Hawkers’ problems
3. Governance Failures
   - **restrictive licensing**
   - legal recognition
   - regulation, not removal
   - revenue generation
   - exclusionary planning
4. Others
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>BELLAGIO DECLARATION</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS**  
#9. regulating quality and service provided

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>SOLUTION SCENARIO</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

1. Scale / Net significance  
2. Hawkers’ problems  

3. Governance Failures  
   - restrictive licensing  
     - legal recognition  
     - regulation, not removal  
     - revenue generation  
     - regulating quality...  
   - exclusionary planning

4. Others
BELLAGIO DECLARATION

MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS

PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG

MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A

HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR

SOLUTION SCENARIO

1. Scale / Net significance
2. Hawkers’ problems
3. Governance Failures
   - restrictive licensing
     - legal recognition
     - regulation, not removal
     - revenue generation
     - regulating quality...
   - exclusionary planning
4. Others
**BELLAGIO DECLARATION**

3 of the 11 recommendations

**MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS**

5 of the 16 recommendations

**PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG**

Alternative regime premised on designating red, amber and green spatial zones

**MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A**

5 of the 9 objectives

**HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR**

6 of the 10 consensus points

---

**SOLUTION SCENARIO**

1. Scale / Net significance

2. Hawkers’ problems

3. Governance Failures
   - restrictive licensing
     - legal recognition
     - regulation, not removal
     - revenue generation
     - regulating quality...
   - exclusionary planning

**LARGEST GROUP OF SUGGESTIONS/DEMANDS**

5 of the 16 recommendations

3 of the 11 recommendations

Alternative regime premised on designating red, amber and green spatial zones

5 of the 9 objectives

6 of the 10 consensus points

PMO: accommodating

Others: special areas

But PMO --> **haats**

4. Others
SOLUTION SCENARIO

1. Scale / Net significance

2. Hawkers’ problems
   - restrictive licensing
     - legal recognition
     - regulation, not removal
     - revenue generation
     - regulating quality...
   - exclusionary planning
     - provisions in plans
     - in line with natural markets
     - quantitative norms
     - qualitative guidelines
     - time share / multiple use
     - assigning part places
     - enforcement

3. Governance Failures
   - other

4. Others
## PROBLEM PERSPECTIVE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STATUTORY MASTER PLAN: 1990</th>
<th>POLICY DIALOGUE: 2001</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Scale / Net significance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Hawkers’ problems</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Governance Failures</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PROBLEM PERSPECTIVE

Like the policy dialogue of 2001, the 1990 Plan notes in respect of **SCALE**:

“The phenomenon of informal sector is part of rapid urbanisation experienced by all the developing countries…”

The census… carried out in the later part of 1981… reveals about 1,39,000 informal sector units… excluding weekly markets…”

Considering the stage of development of the country and economic level of migrants for the next two decades we may assume that the informal sector would continue”.

(p.120)

STATUTORY MASTER PLAN: 1990

POLICY DIALOGUE: 2001

1. Scale / Net significance
2. Hawkers’ problems
3. Governance Failures
Like the policy dialogue of 2001, the 1990 Plan notes in respect of **SIGNIFICANCE**:

“informal sector… with highly reduced needs of equipment and buildings is important as a source of employment and also for the economic functioning of the city”

“This sector though with lower productivity... provides much needed employment to the unskilled and semi-skilled.

Those working in the informal sector mostly belong to economically weaker section...

It is of utmost importance that economic development of this sector is integrated in the physical planning process”.

(p.17, 120)
PROBLEM PERSPECTIVE

Like the policy dialogue of 2001, the 1990 Plan notes in respect of SIGNIFICANCE also:

Hawking, if properly integrated, would
“create lively shopping areas” and
“add to the cityscape ...bringing in a lot of richness and experience of the city in a developing country”.
(p.13, 18)
PROBLEM PERSPECTIVE

Like the policy dialogue of 2001, the 1990 Plan notes the fact of hawkers’ EXPLOITATION:

“the provision of informal sector trade units should be ensured so that …
the poor to which informal sector serves are not exploited upon”.
(p.18)

1. Scale / Net significance
2. Hawkers’ problems
3. Governance Failures

STATUTORY MASTER PLAN: 1990

POLICY DIALOGUE: 2001
Like the policy dialogue of 2001, the 1990 Plan notes **LIMITATIONS OF LICENSING:**

“The Municipal Corporation of Delhi is charging a certain fee termed as teh-bazari for continued use of particular space...

However, a large number of units are either mobile or not covered under teh-bazari”.

(p.17)
Like the policy dialogue of 2001, the 1990 Plan notes **PREVIOUS PLANNING FAILURES**:

“The MPD 62 estimated that there would be about 20,000 informal sector units by 1981 ... less than 15%…

The Plan did not contain any specific proposal for the integration of ...informal sector units in the Development Schemes”.

(p.120)
SOLUTION SCENARIO

As suggested/demanded in 2001, the 1990 Plan

1. Scale / Net significance
2. Hawkers’ problems
3. Governance Failures

• exclusionary planning
  • provisions in plans
  • in line with natural markets
• quantitative norms
• qualitative guidelines
• time share / multiple use
• assigning part places
• enforcement

STATUTORY MASTER PLAN: 1990

POLICY DIALOGUE: 2001
SOLUTION SCENARIO

As suggested/demanded in 2001, the 1990 Plan makes detailed provision all over the city. (It also stipulates that these provisions be ensured at the time of sanction of plans)

Based on natural propensity of hawkers to locate near markets, work areas, etc.

Spells out in great detail quantitative norms (these allow for 3-4 lakh hawkers in Delhi).

Also mentions qualitative guidelines (...few standard efficient colourful designs... ...public conveniences, waste disposal...)

Also speaks of multiple use of public spaces (Parking, etc... weekly markets)

Also speaks of using available spaces (if not obstructing traffic... till developed/plan)

STATUTORY MASTER PLAN: 1990

POLICY DIALOGUE: 2001

1. Scale / Net significance
2. Hawkers' problems
3. Governance Failures

- exclusionary planning
- provisions in plans
- in line with natural markets
- quantitative norms
- qualitative guidelines
- time share / multiple use
- assigning part places
- enforcement
As suggested/demanded in 2001, the 1990 Plan makes detailed provision all over the city. (It also stipulates that these provisions be ensured at the time of sanction of plans)

bases these natural propensity of hawkers to locate near markets, work areas, etc, etc

spells out in great detail quantitative norms (these allow for 3-4 lakh hawkers in Delhi)

also mentions qualitative guidelines (…few standard efficient colourful designs…
...public conveniences, waste disposal…)

also speaks of multiple use of public spaces (Parking, etc… weekly markets)

also speaks of using available spaces (if not obstructing traffic… till developed/plan)

The 1990 Plan already and adequately meets these 2001 demands

• exclusionary planning
  • provision in plans
  • in line with natural markets
  • quantitative norms
  • qualitative guidelines
  • time share / multiple use
  • assigning part places
  • enforcement

SOLUTION SCENARIO

1. Scale / Net significance
2. Hawkers’ problems
3. Governance Failures

STATUTORY MASTER PLAN: 1990

POLICY DIALOGUE: 2001
Inadequacies of licensing systems are largely rooted in the inability to find enough hawking spaces that do not pose a nuisance to others. Once there is enough such space, municipal authorities should have no problem issuing licenses to all hawkers.

Even the license free alternative regulatory regime proposed by PMO can (only) become practicable by using these spaces.

The 1990 Plan has 3-4 lakh spaces to meet these 2001 demands.
SOLUTION SCENARIO

Inadequacies of licensing systems are largely rooted in the inability to find enough hawking spaces that do not pose a nuisance to others. Once there is enough such space, municipal authorities should have no problem issuing licenses to all hawkers.

Even the license free alternative regulatory regime proposed by PMO can (only) become practicable by using these spaces.

STATUTORY MASTER PLAN: 1990

POLICY DIALOGUE: 2001

1. Scale / Net significance
2. Hawkers’ problems
3. Governance Failures
   • restrictive licensing
   • exclusionary planning
SOLUTION SCENARIO

1. Scale / Net significance
2. Hawkers’ problems
3. Governance Failures

The 1990 Plan makes 2001 governance concerns redundant.

Non-implementation was not a concern in the 2001 dialogue.
Hawkers’ specific problem is harassment...
(not poverty, credit need, etc…).

This is based in performance-nuisance conflict
(which in turn is basis for laws for removal, etc)

Not just legal also planned space is needed
(otherwise conflict remains… despite ‘paper’)

Corruption basis of harassment not addressed
… not a Master Plan issue
… also… not addressed in 2001 either

The 1990 Plan already takes care of the ‘basis’ of the harassment, etc concern of 2001
SOLUTION SCENARIO

Master Plan provides for 3-4 lakh hawkers ...
(which is line with the (varying) estimates)
Norms are based on consumer population
(and hence rooted in economic viability)
...better than limitlessly ‘encouraging’
(growth needs correction through economic
policy ...not supply side limitless planning)

Unlike the demands/suggestions of 2001, the Master Plan views hawking as part of trade...
blurring the edges, so to speak
through provisions for low turnover shops
... upward flexibility in hawking norms
... ‘bridge’ to move out of hawking

STATUTORY MASTER PLAN: 1990

1. Scale / Net significance
2. Hawkers’ problems
3. Governance Failures

1. Scale / Net significance
2. Hawkers’ problems
3. Governance Failures

Unlikely the demands/suggestions of 2001, the 1990 Plan addresses net significance by resolving nuisance-performance...

POLICY DIALOGUE: 2001

Until 1990 Plan, policy dialogue on scale / growth...
THE MASTER PLAN OF 1990 OFFERS A BETTER DEAL TO HAWKERS AND THE CITY THAN ‘DEMANDS’ OF 2001 NOT LEAST OF ALL BECAUSE IT IS STATUTORY... …NOT JUST POLICY DEMAND

STATUTORY MASTER PLAN: 1990 POLICY DIALOGUE: 2001
WHEN PARLIAMENT HAD APPROVED AN ADEQUATE ‘SOLUTION’ IN 1990...

WHY WAS THE ‘PROBLEM’ BEING DEBATED IN 2001...

WITHOUT REFERING TO THE STATUTORY ‘SOLUTION’...

AND ITS NON-IMPLEMENTATION...

STATUTORY MASTER PLAN: 1990

POLICY DIALOGUE: 2001
WHY WAS THE ‘PROBLEM’ BEING DEBATED IN 2001...

WITHOUT REFERING TO THE STATUTORY ‘SOLUTION’...

AND ITS NON-IMPLEMENTATION...

What are the IMPLICATIONS?
What are the IMPLICATIONS of ‘POLICY DIALOGUE’ IGNORING STATUTORY PROVISIONS
Since 1990...

Extortion by MCD / Police / others...

Rs.3300 crores!

DDA’s ‘profit’ from non-implementation...

real estate equivalent to ~40 community centres!
For hawkers:
IDs / licenses in place of land
Poorer spatial options - like *haats* or just *sayam rekhas*

For others:
Substantively unchanged hawking
Stressing uses on hawking spaces

Policy in place of Statute

**Condoning culprits**

**Shortchanging victims**
Contempt of Parliament approved solution by MoUD, PMO, LG...

Precipitated by NGOs not exclusively engaging on hawking

Simultaneous ‘national policy’ initiative from *Manushi*-PMO and *SEWA*-MoUD

In Delhi, simultaneous ‘solution’ (*Manushi*-PMO-LG) and research on ‘problem’ (*SEWA*-MoUD-SPA)

Unchanged ground realities!!!

**IMPLICATIONS** OF ‘POLICY DIALOGUE’ IGNORING STATUTORY PROVISIONS
S Swaminathan A Aiyer: *ToI*, Nov 25
“Planners should be sacked en-masse... Planners should be in jail”

Criticism ill-informed, uncalled for. But oft-repeated lie becomes truth.

Plan-bashing has become popular pastime in participatory planning

Justifies (new) plan-making... by non-planners

But planned development is not possible if no one has faith in it.

**IMPLICATIONS** OF ‘POLICY DIALOGUE’ IGNORING STATUTORY PROVISIONS

Condoning culprits
Shortchanging victims
Abetting anarchy
Undermining faith...
DDA had a skeleton in its closet...
But no one else drew attention either.

Reinventing the wheel is more easy / interesting / glamorous than rolling it.

But new, newer, newest wallpaper production will not deliver planned development... only wallpaper.
WHAT IS MOST WORRYING IS THAT EMERGENT STYLES OF PARTICIPATORY PLANNING SEEM TO HAVE REDUCED ‘DEVELOPMENT DIALOGUE’ TO A CACOPHONY...

... WITH NO ROOM FOR VOICES OF REAL PEOPLE ...
Efforts of Vasant Kunj’s hawkers to roll the wheel... rather than reinvent it...
A SUBALTERN STORY
NEW DELHI, 2001

Efforts of Vasant Kunj’s hawkers to roll the wheel... rather than reinvent it...
14 convenient shopping centres built
- No low-turnover shops / hawkers
- One has platforms... lying unused for 10 years
- In others, space has been used up...

4 local shopping centres built
- Nothing local... at times no shops!
- No low turn-over shops / hawkers

3 local shopping / 1 community centre un-built

VASANT KUNJ … … DESIGNED FOR 100000 PEOPLE, WITH FACILITIES AS PER 1990 PLAN
14 DDA convenient shopping centres built
- No low-turnover shops / hawkers
- One has platforms... lying unused for 10 years
- In others, space has been used up...

4 DDA local shopping centres built
- Nothing local... at times no shops!
- No low turn-over shops / hawkers

3 local shopping / 1 community centre un-built

Other spaces for hawkers also not ensured...

Over **750** hawkers could have been provided for...

But they are on roadsides...

*This is their tale...*
Jan’01: LG announced removal drive
Feb’01: >300 wrote... started meetings
Mar’01: Formed VKRPVEM... sent postcards
Apr’01: Commissioned a report
May’01: Gave report... press conference
Jun’01: Received assurance from DDA VC, met/got assurance from Com(Plg)

UPHILL STRUGGLE

Ordinary efforts

SECTOR C POCKET 1
7 informal units and 2 fruit/vegetable shops
May’01:

19, 22: ToI / ET: hawkers + rickshaws
   Invited authors... didn’t come
   Sent rejoinder... wasn’t carried

29, 30: Rumour of removal on 30th
   Sent urgent faxes to all
   Call to MoUD... SEWA workshop
   Went... not allowed to talk of Plan
   Gave report to Jagmohan... wrote

Till July end no action on assurances

Later told “LG has some other ideas”
DDA hadn’t earmarked space, as promised
Nor issued an interim letter to show others
Harassment continued as before
DDA’s own staff increased harassment
Others seeking Master Plan implementation for cheap plots, etc were demonstrating
End July VKRPVEM joined them

This apolitical demonstration in support of the Master Plan had support of flat walas also. It lasted 2 whole months, but didn’t move DDA
Aug 30: Sent memorandum to PM...

Sep 04: VP Singh wrote to PM

Sep 06: Wrote to SHO, DC-MCD...

Sep 25: Wrote PM re continuing problems

Sep 29: DDA removed from roads...

Wrote... called meeting of all engaging on Master Plan in VK

UPHILL STRUGGLE

Ordinary efforts

Encounters with policy dialog

Demonstration for the Plan

Engaging on PM intervention
Oct 05: with slum samities, RWAs... MPISG

Oct 08: MPISG wrote to PM... Federation

Oct 09: Federation of RWAs and VKRPVEM *bhagidari* for ‘interim arrangement’

Transparent process...

**UPHILL STRUGGLE**

**Ordinary efforts**

**Encounters with policy dialog**

**Demonstration for the Plan**

**Engaging on PM intervention**

**Extraordinary efforts**
Ordinary efforts

Encounters with policy dialog

Demonstration for the Plan

Engaging on PM intervention

Extraordinary efforts

Oct 05: with slum samities, RWAs... MPISG

Oct 08: MPISG wrote to PM... Federation

Oct 09: Federation of RWAs and VKRPVEM *bhagidari* for ‘interim arrangement’

Most dramatic equal benefit case...
In line with law (Master Plan), policy (PM)...
In the spirit of bhagidari... (more purposive)
In the pursuit of legitimate public interest...
Purely interim, wholly transparent support...

JUSTIFIED SENSE OF ACCOMPLISHMENT

C-9 RWA President and VKRPVEM C-9 unit rep
JUSTIFIED SENSE OF ACCOMPLISHMENT

UPHILL STRUGGLE

Ordinary efforts

Encounters with policy dialog

Demonstration for the Plan

Engaging on PM intervention

Extraordinary efforts

On the top...

in the uphill struggle
Public servants’ wrath
Public servants’ wrath

October 15, 2001
October 15, 2001

While bonafide stakeholders were pleased...
Public servants were displeased.
On Oct 14 VKRPVEM wrote with concern...

On Oct 15, 16 and 17 VKRPVEM, MPISG, Federation, etc wrote with more concern...
No one responded
And then...
Public servants’ wrath

October 18, 2001
During Feb-Oct’01 ~150 letters were sent... ... asking only for long overdue 'right’ ...

On 18 Oct ‘they’ destroyed all *because* we had nothing in writing from ‘them’  
( ‘They’ did not *need* any even for this!)

We wrote some more letters...
We made a film...

Despite all the hype about *Bhagidari*
Despite all the hype about PM’s intervention
Despite all the hype about Master Plan

We found practically no audience!

October 31, 2001
Our (Congress) MLA and (BJP) Councilor kept a safe distance...

We tried to meet our (BJP) MP - on Oct 17 and later for a question in Parliament

In November we wrote to other MPs

On Dec 2 our MP was in Vasant Kunj while Parliament was in session

We went to talk about our Question.

We ended up “disrupting” the meeting... and getting manhandled, humiliated...

Our MLC ‘punished’ with removal vans...

... and other forms of intimidation

Meetings, etc, became impossible
I failed to engage planning fraternity
despite an open letter in July
a pavement seminar in August
Plg Commission presentation in August
requests to show our film in Oct
a rejoinder to ToI in November...

I failed to engage politicians as a planner
They considered me street politician
(After Dec 2 even extortionist, etc...
even felt I should be in jail ...a’la ToI!)

I got SPA ToR, HUDCO seminar release ...
I wrote to the minister (cc SPA, HUDCO...)

Obviously, no one sees me as a planner
trying to draw attention to the pro-poor provisions of the Master Plan...
Republic Day week, 2002: Vasant Kunj
Our MLA celebrated in an illegal farmhouse
DDA put up local shopping board in J-zone
Our MCD/Councilor issued hawking licenses
...on the site that hawkers had vacated in Oct
...our police disregarded residents’ complaints
...shops/non-hawking trades ‘accommodated’
...some hawkers were bull-dozed
**MANUSHI** | **SEWA**
---|---
1995 | Film on hawkers /rickshaw pullers | International Alliance Street Vendors Bellagio Declaration
1998 |  | National Alliance ... NASVI
1999 |  | NASVI Regional Meetings, etc
2001 | Conference | MoUD-SEWA National Policy Dialogue MoUD-SEWA RECOMMENDATIONS
April | Film screened | National Task Force... MoUD-NASVI
May |  | MoUD Task Force letter to states
June | Manushi NOT included Wrote CVC....wrote CM,MCD,Police First Lok Sunwayi | MoUD ToR FOR STUDY BY S.P.A
| | | HUDCO SPONSORED SEMINAR
August | PMO POLICY / LETTER TO LG Second Lok Sunwayi |  |  |

We, The People...

...have become purely incidental in the portrait of anarchy being painted in our name...

Where do these two tales position us in the big picture?